

The Stability-Instability Paradox: Nuclear Weapons and Brinksmanship in South Asia

Michael Krepon and Chris Gagné, editors

Report No. 38

June 2001

Copyright©2001 11 Dupont Circle, NW Ninth Floor Washington, DC 20036 phone 202.223.5956 fax 202.238.9604 cgagne@stimson.org www.stimson.org

About the Project

The Henry L. Stimson Center has been working to promote regional security in South Asia since 1991. The project focuses heavily on nuclear risk reduction, confidence-building, and Kashmir.

The Center's programming has six main components:

- C First, we hold a series of meetings in Washington for diplomats and military attachés, media, executive and legislative officials, and representatives from nongovernmental organizations. These meetings provide an opportunity to discuss problem-solving ideas in a congenial setting.
- C Second, we commission papers to stimulate thinking and problem-solving approaches on topics of interest. We are also interested in collaborations across borders to encourage networking. We publish commissioned work as funding permits.
- C Third, with local co-sponsorship, we convene workshops within countries of interest, reaching key target audiences: government officials, military officers, journalists, academics, and researchers.
- C Fourth, we host a Visiting Fellows program, whereby talented individuals from India, Pakistan, and China carry out research and writing at the Stimson Center.
- C Fifth, we publish and distribute widely materials on topics of interest. We also place our publications and non-published work on the Stimson Center's website (www.stimson.org).
- Sixth, we moderate a cross-border internet dialogue, known as the Southern Asia Internet Forum, designed to generate open dialogue, and broaden the scope of discussion, among individuals working on security issues in the region (www.stimson.org/cbm/saif/saif.html).

Support for The Stimson Center's CBM Project is provided by the Carnegie Corporation of New York, the W. Alton Jones Foundation, and the William and Flora Hewlett Foundation.

Table of Contents

About the Project	iii
Table of Contents	V
Introduction	vi
Nuclear Risk Reduction: Is Cold War Experience Applicable to South Asia?	1
Nuclear Restraint, Nuclear Risk Reduction, and the Security–Insecurity Paradox in South Asia	15
Nuclear Risk Reduction in South Asia: Building on Common Ground	37
Missile Threat Reduction and Monitoring in South Asia	59
The Logic of Third Party Mediation over Kashmir	83
Notes on Contributors	

Contributor's Notes

Harinder Baweja is an Associate Editor with the weekly newsmagazine *India Today* in Delhi. A current affairs reporter, she has concentrated her energies covering insurgencies, first in Punjab and now in Kashmir. She has written extensively on the Kashmir issue since 1989 and her work has naturally taken her to Pakistan. She was in Islamabad in May 1998 when Pakistan's bomb came out of the basement and has had the rare chance of visiting Pakitani Kashmir. She also covered the Kargil conflict for the magazine and her book on the war, *A Soldiers Diary - Kargil, the Inside Story* was published in April 2000.

Kent Biringer is a Distinguished Member of the Technical Staff at Sandia National Laboratories and serves as Deputy Program Manager and as South Asia Project Manager at the Cooperative Monitoring Center (CMC). The Center works with U.S. and foreign participants to explore ways that technology can facilitate regional confidence-building in such areas as arms control, nonproliferation, and environmental security. Kent has worked at Sandia for 25 years in solar and fossil energy research, systems analysis, manned space exploration, arms control, nonproliferation and cooperative monitoring. His educational training is in mechanical engineering with bachelor's and master's degrees from Rice University. Kent is a Fellow in the American Society of Mechanical Engineers, has authored over 30 papers, and is a registered professional engineer in New Mexico. Before coming to Sandia he worked for Atlantic Richfield Oil Company.

Dr. P.R. Chari is a Visiting Professor at the Centre for the Study of Developing Societies and Director of the Institute for Peace and Conflict Studies in New Delhi. He has also served as Director of the Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses in New Delhi. Dr. Chari is a former member of the Indian Administrative Service and he served two spells (1971-75 & 1985-88) in the Ministry of Defence where his last position there was Additional Secretary. Books authored, co-authored, or edited by Dr. Chari include: *Indo-Pak Nuclear Stand off: Role of the United States* (1995), *Brasstacks and Beyond: Perception and Management Crisis* (1995), *Nuclear Non-Proliferation in India and Pakistan: South Asian Perspectives* (1996), *India: Towards Millennium* (1998), *Perspectives on National Security in South Asia: In Search of a New Paradigm* (1999), and *Kargil: The Tables Turned* (2001). He is currently working on co-authored books on the Simla Agreement and the 1990 Crisis in India-Pakistan relations as well as edited volumes on *Governance and Security in South Asia* and *A Theoretical Approach to Human Security and the Biological Weapons Convention*.

Chris Gagné is the Research Associate for the Confidence-Building Measures project, with a focus on India and Pakistan. Chris joined the project in 1999 after working at Stimson as a Herbert Scoville Jr. Peace Fellow. He graduated from Dickinson College in 1998 with a BA in Anthropology and Policy Studies and a concentration in International Policy. He has studied in southern India, and returned to the region after graduation as assistant to the director of the South India Term Abroad (SITA) program. He also interned as a research assistant to a professor of national security at the Army War College where he compiled and analyzed information about weapons transactions and security concerns in Southeast Asia and gathered information for a project on confidence-building measures in terminating conflict.

Michael Krepon is President Emeritus of the Henry L. Stimson Center. He is the author of Strategic Stalemate, Nuclear Weapons and Arms Control in American Politics (1984), Arms Control in the Reagan Administration (1989), and co-editor of Verification and Compliance, A Problem-Solving Approach (1988), Commercial Observation Satellites and International Security (1990), The Politics of Arms Control Treaty Ratification (1991), Open Skies, Arms Control and Cooperative Security (1992), Crisis Prevention, Confidence Building, and Reconciliation in South Asia (1995), and Global Confidence-Building: New Tools for Troubled Regions (2000).