

# Exploiting Natural Resources

---

**Growth, Instability, and Conflict in the  
Middle East and Asia**

**Richard Cronin**

**Amit Pandya**

***Editors***

Copyright © 2009  
The Henry L. Stimson Center

ISBN: 978-0-9821935-0-1

Cover photos: Open cast iron mine, India © 2006 Robert Harding/Robert Harding World  
Imagery/Corbis; Illegal logs on truck, Vietnam © 2002 Tim Page/Corbis

Cover design by Free Range Studios  
Book design/layout by Nita Congress

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any  
form or by any means without prior written consent from  
The Henry L. Stimson Center.

The Henry L. Stimson Center  
1111 19th Street, NW, 12th Floor  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: 202.223.5956  
Fax: 202.238.9604  
[www.stimson.org](http://www.stimson.org)

## Notes

### ***Water Resource Management Challenges in the GCC Countries: Four Scenarios***

1. Arab Gulf Programme for UN Development Organizations (AGFUND)/World Bank, *A Water Sector Assessment Report on the Countries of the Cooperation Council of the Arab States of the Gulf*, World Bank Report No. 32539-MNA (Washington, DC: World Bank, 2005).

2. Ibid.

3. World Bank Middle East and North Africa Regional Water Initiative, “Middle East and Mediterranean Regional Day: Moving from Scarcity to Security through Policy Reform,” Summary Report (Kyoto, Japan: World Bank, 2003).

4. J. Al-Alawi and M. Abdulrazzak, “Water in the Arabian Peninsula: Problems and Perspectives,” in *Water in the Arab World, Perspectives and Prognoses*, P. Rogers and P. Lydon, eds. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University, Division of Applied Sciences, 1994).

5. AGFUND/World Bank 2005, op. cit.

6. Waleed K. Al-Zubari, “Alternative Water Policies for the Gulf Cooperation Council Countries,” in *Water Resources Perspectives: Evaluation, Management, and Policy*, A. S. Al-Sharhan and W. W. Wood, eds., pp. 155–67 (Amsterdam: Elsevier Science, 2003).

7. Al-Zubari 2003, op. cit.

8. Waleed K. Al-Zubari, “Integrated Groundwater Resources Management in the GCC Countries—A Review,” *Proceedings of the WSTA 8th Gulf Water Conference*, Bahrain, March 2–6, 2008 (Bahrain: Water Science and Technology Association, 2008).

9. Al-Alawi and Abdulrazzak 1994, op. cit.

10. Ibid.

11. A. Al-Turbak, “Water in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia: Policies and Challenges,” paper presented at the Future Vision of the Saudi Economy symposium organized by the Ministry of Planning (2003).

12. Al-Zubari 2003, op. cit.

13. United Nations, *ESCWA Water Development Report 2: State of Water Resources in the ESCWA Region*, Report E/ESCWA/SDPD/2007/6 (Beirut: United Nations, Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia, 2007).

14. Bahrain: 66 percent; Kuwait: 90 percent; Oman: 33 percent; Qatar: 100 percent; Saudi Arabia: 41 percent; United Arab Emirates: 81 percent. AGFUND/World Bank 2005, op. cit.

15. Waleed K. Al-Zubari, “Toward the Establishment of a Total Water Cycle Management and Re-use Program in the GCC Countries,” in *Water in the Arabian Peninsula, Problems and Policies*, K. A. Mahdi, ed., pp. 255–73 (Reading, UK: Ithaca Press, 1997).

16. Bahrain: 85 BCM; Kuwait: 335 BCM; Oman: 340 BCM; Qatar: 220 BCM; Saudi Arabia: 15,830 million cubic meters; United Arab Emirates: 2,483 million cubic meters.

17. Al-Zubari 2003, op. cit.

### ***The Political Economy of Forest Management in Pakistan***

1. For example, see Babar Shahbaz, G. Mbeyale, and T. Haller, “Tree, Trust and the State: Analysis of Participatory Forest Governance in Pakistan and Tanzania,” *Journal of International Development* 20 (2008).

2. Babar Shahbaz, U. Geiser, and A. Suleri, “Stakeholders of Natural Forests in North West Frontier Province of Pakistan: Typology, Influence and Conflicts,” *Sustainable Development Alternatives* (Islamabad, in press).

3. M. Poffenberger, "Communities and Forest Management in South Asia" (Santa Barbara, CA: WG-CIFM Asia Forest Network, 2000).

4. L. Hassan, "An Anatomy of State Failures in the Forest Management in Pakistan," available at [http://mpr.aub.uni-muenchen.de/6513/1/MPRA\\_paper\\_6513.pdf](http://mpr.aub.uni-muenchen.de/6513/1/MPRA_paper_6513.pdf) (2008); Sultan-i-Rome, "Forestry in the Princely State of Swat and Kalam (North-West Pakistan): A Historical Perspective on Norms and Practices," National Centre for Competence in Research North-South IP-6 Working Paper (Zurich: University of Zurich, Department of Geography, 2005).

5. Babar Shahbaz, T. Ali, and A. Suleri, "A Critical Analysis of Forest Policies of Pakistan: Implications for Sustainable Livelihoods," *Mitigation and Adaptation Strategies of Global Change* 12(4) (2007).

6. Babar Shahbaz, "Analysis of Institutional Changes in Forest Management and Its Impact of Rural Livelihood Strategies," doctoral thesis, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan, and Zurich University, Switzerland (2007).

7. Abid Q. Suleri, "Regional Study on Forest Policy and Institutional Reform," Final Report of the Pakistan Case Study (Manila: Asian Development Bank, 2002).

8. Asian Development Bank, Forestry Sector Project (Pakistan), [www.adb.org/Documents/News/1995/nr1995126.asp](http://www.adb.org/Documents/News/1995/nr1995126.asp); accessed March 2004 (1995).

9. Shahbaz (2007), op. cit.

10. T. Ali, B. Shahbaz, and A. Q. Suleri, "Analysis of Myths and Realities of Deforestation in Northwest Pakistan: Implications for Forestry Extension." *International Journal of Agriculture and Biology* 8(1) (2006).

### ***Socioeconomic Conflicts in Indonesia's Mining Industry***

1. PricewaterhouseCoopers (PWC), *mineIndonesia 2007: Review of Trends in the Indonesian Mining Industry* (Jakarta: KAP Haryanto Sahari & Rekan, 2008); CEIC Asian Data Base (Jakarta, 2008).

2. US Commercial Service, "Indonesia: Coal Mining Equipment," available at [http://commercecan.ic.gc.ca/scdt/bizmap/interface2.nsf/vDownload/IMI\\_8691/\\$file/X\\_4867069.PDF](http://commercecan.ic.gc.ca/scdt/bizmap/interface2.nsf/vDownload/IMI_8691/$file/X_4867069.PDF); accessed June 30, 2008 (2007).

3. PWC 2008, op. cit.

4. Ibid.

5. Ibid.

6. Rudianto Ekawan, "Mencari solusi bagi penambangan di hutan lindung," *Sinar Harapan* September 30, available at [www.sinarharapan.co.id/berita/0209/30/ipt02.html](http://www.sinarharapan.co.id/berita/0209/30/ipt02.html); accessed May 20, 2008 (2002).

7. PWC 2008, op. cit.

8. Direktorat Sumber Daya Mineral dan Pertambangan, "Mengatasi tumpang tindih antara lahan pertambangan dan kehutanan," available at [www.bappenas.go.id/index.php?module=Filemanager&func=download&pathext=ContentExpress/&view=85/6tambang\\_final.pdf](http://www.bappenas.go.id/index.php?module=Filemanager&func=download&pathext=ContentExpress/&view=85/6tambang_final.pdf); accessed May 25, 2008 (2004).

9. Keppres 41/2004.

10. Gajah Kusumo, "Dapat Restu Pusat, Rio Tinto ajukan gugatan di PTUN," *Bisnis Indonesia*, available at <http://202.158.49.150/edisi-cetak/edisi-harian/hukum-bisnis/1id60476.html>; accessed May 30, 2008 (2008).

11. International Crisis Group, "Indonesia: Resources and Conflict in Papua," ICG Asia Report No. 39 (Jakarta, 2002); Emmy Hafid, "Foreign Direct Investment in the Indonesian Mining Sector," paper presented in the CCNM Global Forum on International Investment, February 7–8, 2002, Paris. See also the websites of the Mineral Policy Institute ([www.mpi.org.au/regions/asia/indonesia](http://www.mpi.org.au/regions/asia/indonesia)), WALHI ([www.eng.walhi.or.id/kampanye/psda/konflikmil/examples/](http://www.eng.walhi.or.id/kampanye/psda/konflikmil/examples/)), and JATAM ([www.jatam.org/](http://www.jatam.org/)).

12. Iskandar Zulkarnain, Tri Nuke Pudjiastuti, Anas Saidi, and Yani Mulyaningsih, *Konflik di Daerah Pertambangan: Menuju Penyusunan Konsep Solusi Awal dengan Kasus pada Pertambangan Emas dan Batubara* (Jakarta: LIPI Press, 2004).

13. Clive Aspinall, "Small-Scale Mining in Indonesia," report commissioned by Mining, Minerals, and Sustainable Development, available at [www.iiied.org/mmsd/mmsd\\_pdfs/asm\\_indonesia.pdf](http://www.iiied.org/mmsd/mmsd_pdfs/asm_indonesia.pdf); accessed June 12, 2008 (2001).

14. Zulkarnain et al., 2004, op. cit.

15. Gavin M. Hilson, "The Future of Small-Scale Mining: Environmental and Socioeconomic Perspectives," *Futures* 34: 863–72 (2002).

16. Rusman Heriawan, "Informal Sector Statistics and Supporting Surveys: Indonesian Experience," paper presented at the 7th Meeting of the Expert Group of Informal Sector Statistics (Delhi Group), February 2–4, 2004, New Delhi, available at [http://mospi.nic.in/rusman\\_heriawan\\_a.htm](http://mospi.nic.in/rusman_heriawan_a.htm); accessed June 20, 2008.

17. PWC, *mineIndonesia 2005: Review of Trends in the Indonesian Mining Industry* (Jakarta: PWC, 2006).
18. Erwiza Erman, "Illegal Coalmining in West Sumatra: Access and Actors in the Post-Soeharto Era," in *The Politics and Economics of Indonesia's Natural Resources*, Budy P. Resosudarmo, ed., pp. 206–15 (Singapore: ISEAS, 2005).
19. In general, the government agencies involved in people's mining have so far only collected fees from these activities without attempting to help improve the condition of these miners' lives. Andiko, "Tambang Rakyat: Anak Tiri Pertambangan Nasional," Association for Community and Ecology-Based Legal Reform, available at <http://images.andiko2002.multiply.com/attachment/0/SFTRYwoKCjsAAC6oJgI1/Tambang%20Rakyat.pdf?nmid=101118746>; accessed July 19, 2008 (2006).
20. Jaringan Advokasi Tambang (Jatam), "Meraup Untung Bersama PETI," available at [www.minergynews.com/ngovoice/ggjan02.shtml](http://www.minergynews.com/ngovoice/ggjan02.shtml); accessed June 15, 2008 (2002).
21. Rachman Wiriosudarmo, "Baseline Study and Gap Analysis on Mining in Indonesia, report commissioned by Mining, Minerals, and Sustainable Development, available at [www.iied.org/mmsd/mmsd\\_pdfs/183\\_wiriosudarmo.pdf](http://www.iied.org/mmsd/mmsd_pdfs/183_wiriosudarmo.pdf); accessed June 19, 2008 (2001).
22. Amir Sodikin, "Kalsel Dihidupi Batu Bara Illegal," *Kompas* June 13, 2003.
23. Erwiza Erman, "Rethinking of Legal and Illegal Economy: A Case Study of Tin Mining in Bangka Island," available at <http://globetrotter.berkeley.edu/GreenGovernance/papers/Erman2007.pdf>; accessed June 15, 2008 (2007).
24. Ibid.
25. Tri Nuke Pudjiastuti, "The Pressure of Migrant Illegal Miners on the Dynamical of Local Community: on 1998 Pongkor Gold Mining Case," paper presented at the Asia Pacific Learning Event, Philippines, June 7–12, 2005.
26. Kuntala Lahiri-Dutt, "Informality in Mineral Resources Management in Asia: Raising Questions Relating to Community Economies and Sustainable Development," *Natural Resource Forum* 28: 123–32 (2004).
27. US Agency for International Development, "Minerals and Conflict: A Toolkit for Intervention," available at [www.usaid.gov/our\\_work/cross-cutting\\_programs/conflict/publications/docs/CMM\\_Minerals\\_and\\_Conflict\\_2004.pdf](http://www.usaid.gov/our_work/cross-cutting_programs/conflict/publications/docs/CMM_Minerals_and_Conflict_2004.pdf); accessed June 15, 2008 (2004).
28. Ricardi Adnan, "The Problem of Health and Safety Issues in Gold Mining Communities in Kalimantan," paper presented at the Asia Pacific Learning Event, Philippines, June 7–12, 2005.
29. Aspinall 2001, op. cit.
30. Isabelo Velez, "Benguet Corporation's Acupan Contract Mining Project (Mining in Partnership with the Community)," paper presented at the Asia Pacific Learning Event, Philippines, June 7–12, 2005.
31. A. L. Clark and J. C. Clark, "The New Reality of Mineral Development: Social and Cultural Issues in Asia and Pacific Nations," *Resource Policy* 25: 189–96 (1999).
32. Ibid.
33. WALHI 2006, op. cit.
34. International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) and International Council on Mining and Metals (ICMM), *Integrating Mining and Biodiversity Conservation: Case Studies from around the World* (Gland, Switzerland, and London: IUCN and ICMM, 2003).
35. Aspinall 2001, op. cit.; Thomas Hentschel, Felix Hruschka, and Michael Priester, "Global Report on Artisanal and Small-Scale Mining," report commissioned by Mining, Minerals, and Sustainable Development, available at [www.iied.org/mmsd/mmsd\\_pdfs/asm\\_global\\_report\\_draft\\_jan02.pdf](http://www.iied.org/mmsd/mmsd_pdfs/asm_global_report_draft_jan02.pdf); accessed June 18, 2008 (2002).
36. Pudjiastuti 2005, op. cit.; Gary McMahon, Ella Subdibjo, Jean Aden, Aziz Bouzaher, Giovanna Dore, and Ramani Kunanayagam, "Mining and the Environment in Indonesia: Long-Term Trends and Repercussions of the Asian Economic Crisis," EASES Discussion Paper Series 21438, available at [www.natural-resources.org/minerals/cd/docs/twb/mining\\_indonesia.pdf](http://www.natural-resources.org/minerals/cd/docs/twb/mining_indonesia.pdf); accessed June 20, 2008 (2000).
37. Erman 2005, op. cit.
38. Aspinall 2001, op. cit.
39. Erman 2005, op. cit.; Hentschel, Hruschka, and Priester 2002, op. cit.
40. Aspinall 2001, op. cit.
41. *Sinar Harapan*, April 21, 2008, available at [www.vhrmedia.com/vhr-news/berita/Bangka-Belitung-Contoh-Buruk-Aturan-Tambang-1631.html](http://www.vhrmedia.com/vhr-news/berita/Bangka-Belitung-Contoh-Buruk-Aturan-Tambang-1631.html); accessed June 30, 2008.
42. Wiriosudarmo 2001, op. cit.; P. Cesare and P. Maxwell, "Mine Closure Legislation in Indonesia: The Role of Mineral Industry Involvement," *Natural Resources Forum* 27: 42–52 (2003).

43. Cesare and Maxwell 2003, op. cit. See also Wiriosudarmo 2001, op. cit.
44. Article 15.
45. Article 74.
46. M. Cecilia Gonzales Guerra, "Community Relations in Mineral Development Projects," available at [www.dundee.ac.uk/cepmlp/journal/html/vol11/article11-6.pdf](http://www.dundee.ac.uk/cepmlp/journal/html/vol11/article11-6.pdf); accessed June 23, 2008 (2002).
47. Geraldine McGuire, "Managing Mine Closure Risks in Developing Communities—A Case Study, Kelian Equatorial Mining, Indonesia," paper presented at Mining Risk Management Conference, Sydney, September 9–12, 2003.
48. *Down to Earth* No. 57 (May 2003); available at <http://dte.gn.apc.org/57iRT.htm>; accessed June 30, 2008.
49. McGuire 2003, op. cit.
50. *The Economist*, July 22, 2006.

### ***Making the Connections: Water, Forests, and Minerals Exploitation in South and Southeast Asia***

1. World Rainforest Movement, *Mining: Social and Environmental Impacts*, p. 16 (March 2004).
2. Oxfam America, *Small Scale Gold Mining in Cambodia: A Situation Assessment* (July 2004).
3. Centre for Science and Environment, *Rich Lands Poor People: Is Sustainable Mining Possible?, State of India's Environment, A Citizen's Report 6*, p. 74 (New Delhi: Centre for Science and Environment, 2008).
4. Chandra Bhushan, "Rich Lands, Poor People: The Socio-Environmental Challenges of Mining in India," p. 3 (New Delhi: Centre for Science and Environment, 2008).
5. JATAM (Indonesian Mining Advocacy Network) and WALHI-Friends of the Earth Indonesia, "Stop Destroying Our Protected Forests and Small Islands," press release, October 23, 2008, available at [www.eng.walhi.or.id/kampanye/tambang/hutanlindung/mining\\_bhp/](http://www.eng.walhi.or.id/kampanye/tambang/hutanlindung/mining_bhp/).
6. *Ibid.*
7. Centre for Science and Environment 2008, op. cit., p. 10.
8. Oxfam America 2004, op. cit.
9. Bhushan op. cit., p. 6.
10. Cathal Doyle et al., "Mining in the Philippines—Concerns and Conflicts," *Columban Fathers*, p. 11 (2007).
11. Interview conducted by the author in the Philippines, August 2008.
12. Interviews conducted by the author in Thailand and the Philippines, August 2008.
13. Interview conducted by the author in Indonesia, July 2008.
14. Louis V. Verchot et al., "Implications of Country-Level Decisions on the Specification of Crown Cover in the Definition of Forests for Land Area Eligible for Afforestation and Reforestation Activities in the CDM," *Climatic Change* 81: 416 (2007); H. Gyde Lund, "A 'Forest' by Any Other Name," *Environmental Science & Policy* 2: 125 (1999).
15. Sriyanie Miththapala, *Mangroves, Coastal Ecosystems Series Vol. 2*, p. 20 (Colombo, Sri Lanka: IUCN, Ecosystems and Livelihoods Group Asia, 2008); IUCN, "Lack of Clear Regulatory Frameworks for Coastal Zone Management," *Coastal Ecosystems* No. 2 (2006); available at [www.iucn.org/coastalinfo](http://www.iucn.org/coastalinfo).
16. JATAM and WALHI-Friends of the Earth Indonesia 2008, op. cit.
17. Centre for Science and Environment, *Mine No More*, occasional tabloid, p. 20 (New Delhi: Centre for Science and Environment, 2008); Bhushan 2008, op. cit., p. 7.
18. Interview conducted by Kendra Patterson in Bangladesh, September 2008.
19. Miththapala 2008, op. cit., p. 20; IUCN 2006, op. cit.
20. Bhushan 2008, op. cit., p. 7.
21. *Mine No More*, op. cit., p.13.
22. Interview conducted by the author in the Philippines, August 2008.
23. Interview conducted by the author in Indonesia, July 2008.
24. Interview conducted by the author in Indonesia, July 2008.
25. Interview conducted by the author in the Philippines, August 2008.
26. Interview conducted by the author in Thailand, August 2008.
27. The Indonesian Forum for Environment (WALHI-Friends of the Earth Indonesia), "Stop Tailings Disposal into Waterways," available at [www.eng.walhi.or.id/kampanye/tambang/tutuptamb/070627\\_std\\_cu/](http://www.eng.walhi.or.id/kampanye/tambang/tutuptamb/070627_std_cu/).

28. Interview conducted by the author in the Philippines, August 2008.

### ***Natural Resources and the Development-Environment Dilemma***

1. Laurent Cohen-Tanugi, *The Shape of the World to Come: Charting the Geopolitics of the New Century* (New York: Columbia Press, August 2008.) Publication announcement at <http://cup.columbia.edu/book/978-0-231-14600-5/the-shape-of-the-world-to-come>.
2. Ibid.
3. US Department of Energy, Energy Information Administration, "The Persian Gulf," [www.eia.doe.gov/emeu/cabs/Persian\\_Gulf/Background.html](http://www.eia.doe.gov/emeu/cabs/Persian_Gulf/Background.html).
4. Indroneil Ganguly and Ivan Eastin, "Overview of the Indian Market for US Wood Products," Working Paper 105 (University of Washington, College of Forest Resources, 2007).
5. S. Suryantoro and M.H. Manaf, "The Indonesian Energy and Mineral Resources Development and Its Environmental Management to Support Sustainable National Economic Development," paper presented at the OECD Conference in Foreign Direct Investment and Environment in Mining Sector, Paris, February 7–8, 2002.
6. Budy P. Resosudarmo, Ida Aju Pradnja Resosudarmo, Wijayono Sarosa, and Nina L. Subiman, "Socio-economic Conflicts in Indonesia's Mining Industry," in *Exploiting Natural Resources: Growth, Instability, and Conflict in the Middle East and Asia*, Richard Cronin and Amit Pandya, eds., pp. 33–46 (Washington, DC: The Henry L. Stimson Center, 2008).
7. Chris Lang, "Deforestation in Vietnam, Laos and Cambodia," in *Deforestation, Environment, and Sustainable Development: A Comparative Analysis*, D. K. Vajpeyi, ed., pp. 111–37 (Westport, CT: Praeger: 2001).
8. Babar Shahbaz and Abid Qaiyum Suleri, "The Political Economy of Forest Management in Pakistan," in *Exploiting Natural Resources: Growth, Instability, and Conflict in the Middle East and Asia*, Richard Cronin and Amit Pandya, eds., pp. 21–31 (Washington, DC: The Henry L. Stimson Center, 2008).
9. Pinkaew Laungaramsri, "On the Politics of Nature Conservation in Thailand," *Kyoto Review* October 2002. [http://kyotoreview.cseas.kyoto-u.ac.jp/issue/issue1/article\\_168.html](http://kyotoreview.cseas.kyoto-u.ac.jp/issue/issue1/article_168.html).
10. Waleed K. Al-Zubari, "Water Resource Management Issues and Challenges in the GCC Countries: Four Scenarios," in *Exploiting Natural Resources: Growth, Instability, and Conflict in the Middle East and Asia*, Richard Cronin and Amit Pandya, eds., pp. 3–19 (Washington, DC: The Henry L. Stimson Center, 2008).